

June 30, 2003

Ms. Elizabeth Lutton Senior Attorney City of Arlington P.O. Box 90231 Arlington, Texas 76004-3231

OR2003-4458

Dear Ms. Lutton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 183467.

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for the employment records, including records concerning education, certification, and training, for three named individuals and all records related to a specified arrest. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.115, 552.117, 552.119, 552.122, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note that the department has failed to request a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within the ten business day time period as prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. See Gov't Code § 552.302; Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins., 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.--Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Sections 552.103 and 552.122 of the Government Code are discretionary exceptions under

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). Here, we do not address any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

the Public Information Act (the "Act") and, therefore, do not overcome the presumption that the submitted information is public information. See Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general); Open Records Decision No. 551 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 serves only to protect a governmental body's position in litigation and does not itself make information confidential). Therefore, you may not withhold the requested information under sections 552.103 and 552.122 of the Government Code. However, normally, a compelling reason for non-disclosure exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). The remaining exceptions you claim provide such compelling reasons, and thus, we will address them accordingly.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. You claim that the submitted information contains medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 provides in pertinent part:

- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). The MPA governs access to medical records. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The MPA requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which a governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Moreover, information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. See Occ. Code § 159.002(a), (b), (c); Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Based on our review of the submitted information, we have marked the information that is subject to the MPA and may only be released accordingly.

The submitted information also contains information the release of which is governed by chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code applies to "[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, [and] records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional." See also Health and Safety Code § 611.001 (defining "patient" and "professional"). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records

only by certain individuals. See Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The submitted information contains mental health record information, which we have marked, that is confidential under section 611.002 and may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code. Health and Safety Code § 611.002(b); see id. §§ 611.004, 611.0045.

Section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, which makes declarations of medical condition and of psychological and emotional health confidential, provides:

- (a) The commission may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:
  - (1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and
  - (2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.
- (b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to the commission. A declaration is not public information.

Therefore, the department must withhold the submitted declarations pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

You also assert section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

- (c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:
  - (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

We have marked information that involves juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. See Fam. Code § 51.03(a)(3) (defining "conduct indicating a need for supervision" to include "the voluntary absence of a child from his home without the consent of his parent or guardian for a substantial length of time or without intent to return"). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply; therefore, this information is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, and it must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Additionally, we note that section 58.007 does not apply where the information in question involves only a juvenile complainant or witness and not a juvenile suspect or offender. You have failed to explain, and we are unable to determine, that the remaining information in Exhibit 14 involves juvenile suspects or offenders and therefore the remaining information is not confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Further, section 261.201 of the Family Code reads in part as follows:

- (a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:
  - (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
  - (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

We conclude that a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, consists of reports, records, and working papers used or developed in an investigation made under chapter 261 of the Family Code. Because you have not cited any specific rule that the department has adopted with regard to the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, this information is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute). Accordingly, the department must not release this information.

Section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code provides as follows:

- (a) A polygraph examiner, trainee, or employee of a polygraph examiner, or a person for whom a polygraph examination is conducted or an employee of the person, may not disclose information acquired from a polygraph examination to another person other than:
  - (1) the examinee or any other person specifically designated in writing by the examinee;
  - (2) the person that requested the examination;
  - (3) a member, or the member's agent, of a governmental agency that licenses a polygraph examiner or supervises or controls a polygraph examiner's activities;
  - (4) another polygraph examiner in private consultation; or
  - (5) any other person required by due process of law.

Occ. Code § 1703.306. We agree that some of the submitted information was acquired from polygraph examinations. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 1703.306 apply in this case. See Open Records Decision 565 (1990) (construing predecessor statute). Accordingly, the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code and is therefore excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The submitted documents also contain I-9 and W-4 forms. Section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code provides that an Employment Eligibility Verification Form I-9 "may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. See 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); see also 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). The release of submitted I-9 forms in response to this request for information would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. A Form I-9 may be released only for purposes of compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system. A W-4 form is confidential under section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. Therefore, the department must withhold the submitted I-9 and W-4 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law.

Also, criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC") is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems

confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. Id. § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. See generally id. §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. See Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Furthermore, when a law enforcement agency compiles information that depicts an individual as a criminal suspect, arrestee, or defendant, the compilation of information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy in a manner that the same information in an uncompiled state does not. See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press, 489 U.S. 749 (1989); Open Records Decision No. 616 at 2-3 (1993). Thus, any criminal history information that was obtained from the NCIC or TCIC networks, or that is protected by privacy under Reporters Committee, must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Information is protected under the common-law right to privacy when (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. See Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd., 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), cert. denied, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). Prior decisions of this office have found that financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of the test for common-law privacy but that there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. See, e.g., Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (information revealing that employee participates in group insurance plan funded partly or wholly by governmental body is not excepted from disclosure). In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, see Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, see Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990), 523 (1989) (individual's mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), certain personal choices relating to financial transactions between the individual and the governmental body, see Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits and optional insurance coverage; choice of particular insurance carrier; direct deposit authorization; and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care, or dependent care), information concerning the intimate relations

between individuals and their family members, see Open Records Decision No. 470 (1987), and identities of victims of sexual abuse, see Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). Having reviewed the submitted information, we conclude that portions of the information, which we have marked, are protected by common-law privacy and must be withheld under section 552.101. However, the remainder of the information you have marked is not intimate or embarrassing. Therefore, this information is not protected by common-law privacy, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101.

You assert that the birth records in Exhibit 13 are excepted under section 552.115 of the Government Code. Birth or death records maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official are excepted from required public disclosure under section 552.115. However, because the department is not the bureau of vital statistics or a local registration official, a birth certificate held by the department may not be withheld under section 552.115.

You also contend that some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.117(2) of the Government Code. That section excepts from disclosure "information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, or social security number" of a peace officer, or that reveals whether the peace officer has family members. Therefore, the department must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.117(2) of the Government Code. However, we have marked additional information to which section 552.117(2) is inapplicable, and it must be released.

We note that the remaining social security numbers may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. See id. We have no basis for concluding that the remaining social security numbers in the responsive information are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Act on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the department should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Additionally, you assert section 552.119 of the Government Code. That section excepts from public disclosure a photograph of a peace officer<sup>2</sup> that, if released, would endanger the life or physical safety of the officer unless one of three exceptions applies. The three exceptions are: (1) the officer is under indictment or charged with an offense by information; (2) the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>"Peace officer" is defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

officer is a party in a fire or police civil service hearing or a case in arbitration; or (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding. This section also provides that a photograph exempt from disclosure under this section may be made public only if the peace officer gives written consent to the disclosure. Open Records Decision No. 502 (1988). The submitted information includes photographs depicting peace officers, and it does not appear that any of the exceptions are applicable. You have not informed us that the peace officers have executed any written consent to disclosure. Thus, you must withhold the photographs we have marked under section 552.119.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. See Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license, license plate, and motor vehicle information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we have marked additional information to which section 552.130 is inapplicable, and it must be released.

Finally, we note that section 552.136 of the Government Code makes certain account number information confidential and provides in relevant part:

- (a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:
  - (1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or
  - (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.
- (b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Accordingly, the department must withhold the submitted account numbers we have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, we conclude that you must withhold the following information under section 552.101 of the Government Code: 1) the declarations of medical condition and of psychological and emotional health we have marked under section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code; 2) the information we have marked under sections 58.007 and 261.201 of the Family Code; 3) the additional information we have marked pursuant to section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code; 4) the submitted I-9 and W-4 forms under federal

law; 5) any criminal history record information; 6) the information we have marked under common-law privacy; and 7) social security numbers that may be confidential under federal law. Additionally, we conclude that: 8) the medical record information we have marked is subject to the MPA and may only be released accordingly; 9) the mental health record information we have marked is confidential under section 611.002 and may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code; and 10) you must withhold the section 552.117(2), 552.119, 552.130 and 552.136 information. All remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. Id. § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. Id. § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. Id. § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. Id. § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be

sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

V. Mentyoney Westler

W. Montgomery Meitler Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 183467

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Anna O'Day
The O'Day Law Firm
4388 W. Vickery Blvd., Suite 201
Fort Worth, Texas 76107
(w/o enclosures)